

California Research Bureau

October 30, 2015

Gender Wage Gap Scholarly Literature and California State Agency Program Website Review

Data dictionary, results and methodology

Published by the California Research Bureau of the California State Library at the request of
California Commission on the Status of Women and Girls

Authors: Carley Herron, Anoli Motawala and Tonya D. Lindsey, Ph.D.

For questions, please contact Tonya D. Lindsey, Ph.D. at Tonya.Lindsey@library.ca.gov

Version 1.0, published October 30, 2015

Data Dictionary

Academic Literature Tab

Author - Name(s) of the authors

Title - Title of the article

Journal - Title of journal, volume and number where applicable

Year - Year of publication

Worker Type - The population studied

Data - The database, survey or other data source

Findings - Summary of the results and/or implications of the results from the study

Unless otherwise noted, verbatim text from the article

Keywords - Major topics of the article

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Addison, John T.	The role of gender in promotion and pay over a career	2014	The raw data suggest reasonably favorable promotion outcomes for [women] over a career, but any such advantages are found to be confined to less educated females. Further, the strong returns to education in later career stemming from promotion-related earnings growth accrue solely to males. While consistent with fertility timing and choice on the part of educated females, this earnings result is not inconsistent with discrimination as well, reminiscent of findings from an earlier human capital literature.	gender, wage gap, promotions, education
Albrecht, James, Aico Van Vuuren, and Susan Vroman	The black-white gap among young women in 1990 vs 2011: The role of selection and educational attainment	2015	[T]he pattern of selection into employment among young black women is substantially more positive than is the corresponding pattern among young white women. Young women with low market wages are less likely to be employed than are those with higher market wages, low market wages are associated with low levels of education, and the distribution of educational attainment among young black women is considerably less favorable than the corresponding distribution among young white women. This was true in 1990; it is still the case in 2011.... [T]he median log wage gap between young black and young white women increased substantially between 1990 and 2011. This holds both for women who reported a wage in the survey year and after correcting for selection.... Once we control for education and potential experience, the median log wage gap between young black and young white women fell between 1990 and 2011.... [T]he median log wage gap increased over time and...can be (more than) accounted for by differential increases in educational attainment between young black and young white women....	black–white wage gap, selection, women
Alkadry, Mohamad G. and Leslie E. Tower	Covert pay discrimination: How authority predicts pay differences between women and men	2011	Research repeatedly highlights the gap between male and female earnings across the public and private sectors. The authors address an overlooked manifestation of pay discrimination against women in the labor market. Using a survey of 384 public sector chief procurement officers, they analyze the indirect effects of gender on women’s pay through the intervening variable of authority. Gender affects the amount of authority that is delegated to an employee, which, in turn, affects the variance in pay between men and women. Results reveal that gender plays a hidden role in influencing compensation levels by shifting the chain of authority given to executives as they build a career portfolio. The conclusion underscores why gender pay disparities should account for both the indirect and the direct effects of gender on pay.	authority, pay difference, gender, covert

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Bailey, Martha J., Hershbein, Brad, and Miller, Amalia R.	The opt-in revolution? Contraception and the gender gap in wages	2012	Did the Pill unleash the Opt-In Revolution? Our results provide no conclusive answer. They may understate the Pill's broader influence because our empirical strategy does not allow us to explore the effect of changes in access to the Pill beyond age 20 and fails to capture the potentially large social multiplier effects. For instance, the Pill's availability likely altered norms and expectations about marriage and childbearing and firms' decisions to hire and promote women—even among cohorts without legal access to the Pill. Thus, the effects of the Pill may be larger than we find, but it is not clear how much larger. Even these conservative estimates, however, suggest that the Pill's power to transform childbearing from probabilistic to planned shifted women's career decisions and compensation for decades to come.	gender, wage gap, contraception
Bertrand, Marianne, Goldin, Claudia, and Katz, Lawrence F.	Dynamics of the gender gap for young professionals in the financial and corporate sectors	2010	The careers of MBAs from a top US business school are studied to understand how career dynamics differ by gender. Although male and female MBAs have nearly identical earnings at the outset of their careers, their earnings soon diverge, with the male earnings advantage reaching almost 60 log points a decade after MBA completion. Three proximate factors account for the large and rising gender gap in earnings: differences in training prior to MBA graduation, differences in career interruptions, and differences in weekly hours. The greater career discontinuity and shorter work hours for female MBAs are largely associated with motherhood.	gender, pay gap, MBA,
Blau, Francine D.	The feasibility and importance of adding measures of actual experience to cross-sectional data collection	2013	To analyze [wage gap] issues, one needs data on individuals' work histories. Yet the most representative and largest national databases in the United States—the Census, the American Community Survey, and the Current Population Survey (CPS)—do not collect information on actual work experience.... [For] those with interruptions of full-time work experience, these data sources will lead to potentially serious measurement errors and thus biased estimates of the returns to experience as well as the quantity of post school human capital investment.... We demonstrated that having such actual experience data is important for analyzing the gender pay gap, since women continue to have less labor market experience than men, and on-the-job training and learning have been shown to be important components of post-school human capital accumulation.... We demonstrate that having such actual experience data is important for analyzing women's post school human capital accumulation, residual wage inequality, and the gender pay gap. Further, our PDII survey results show that it is feasible to collect actual experience data in cross sectional telephone surveys like the March Current Population Survey's annual supplement.	wage gap, gender, Current Population Survey data

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Blau, Francine D. and Lawrence M. Kahn	The gender wage gap: Extent, trends, and explanations	2016	We conclude that many of the traditional explanations continue to have salience. Although human capital factors are now relatively unimportant in the aggregate, women's work force interruptions and shorter hours remain significant in high skilled occupations, possibly due to compensating differentials. Gender differences in occupations and industries, as well as differences in gender roles and the gender division of labor remain important, and research based on experimental evidence strongly suggests that discrimination cannot be discounted. Psychological attributes or noncognitive skills comprise one of the newer explanations for gender differences in outcomes. Our effort to assess the quantitative evidence on the importance of these factors suggests that they account for a small to moderate portion of the gender pay gap, considerably smaller than say occupation and industry effects, though they appear to modestly contribute to these differences.	gender, gender pay gap, wage differentials, discrimination, human capital investment, occupations, occupational segregation
Boarnet, Marlon and Ping Hsu, Hsin	The gender gap in non-work travel the relative roles of income earning potential and land use	2015	Overall, our evidence shows substantial variation in the within household distribution of chauffeuring activities. The difference is so much larger for households with children that one could reasonably regard the chauffeuring gap as a phenomenon associated with children. Women bear the chauffeuring burden disproportionately. The chauffeuring gap is explained in part by labor market variables and reflects, in part, a distribution of labor market and household work that shows some association with income earning potential. Yet the magnitude of the chauffeuring gap is large enough that it seems unlikely that the entire story is relative income-earning potential.	gender, non-work travel, chauffeuring, income earning potential, land use
Bolitzer, Benjamin and Erin Godtland	Understanding the gender-pay gap in the federal workforce over the past 20 years	2012	The most important finding from our analysis is that the gender-pay gap in the federal workforce has declined significantly primarily because men and women in the federal workforce are more similar in work characteristics related to pay today than in past years. However, the existence of a persistent unexplained pay gap remains. Interestingly, factors that used to account for much of the gap, like education and experience, no longer do, because differences between men and women in these factors have diminished.... Gaining a better understanding of how men and women choose occupations within the federal workforce—whether occupational choice is a function of preferences that are correlated with gender or occupational segregation—is a question that warrants additional research. Furthermore, the existence of a persistent unexplained pay gap between men and women federal workers over a 20-year period, after we controlled for as many factors as our data allowed, means that we cannot rule out the possibility that women are being treated unequally in the federal government.	gender, pay gap, federal workforce
Campbell, Colin and Jessica Pearlman	Period effects, cohort effect, and the narrowing gender wage gap	2013	The narrowing of the gender wage gap that occurred between 1975 and 2009 is largely due to cohort effects. Since the mid-1990s, the gender wage gap has continued to close absent of period effects. While gains in female wages contributed to declines in the gender wage gap for cohorts born before 1950, for later cohorts the narrowing of the gender wage gap is primarily a result of declines in male wages.	gender wage gap, inequality, work

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Carvajal, Manuel, Graciela Armayor, and Lisa Deziel	The gender earnings gap among pharmacists	2012	Men's (but not women's) earnings generally were affected by the opinion variables, whereas women's (but not men's) earnings were influenced by engaging primarily in an administrative role. Working more hours, holding a Pharm.D. degree, and having more children increased men's earnings more than women's earnings, but the opposite was true for possessing greater professional experience and working in retail chain pharmacy.... [C]ontrolling for human-capital stock, job preferences, and opinion variables reduced the initial unadjusted male-female earnings ratio only slightly, even after entering typically male labor market characteristics into the female equations and female characteristics into the male equations. The empirical evidence here points toward the presence of gender bias.	wages, gender, earnings gap, pharmacist workforce
Cha, Youngjoo and Kim Weeden	Overwork and the slow convergence in the gender gap in wages	2014	[W]e show that convergence in the gender gap in hourly pay over these three decades was attenuated by the increasing prevalence of "overwork" (defined as working 50 or more hours per week) and the rising hourly wage returns to overwork. Because a greater proportion of men engage in overwork, these changes raised men's wages relative to women's and exacerbated the gender wage gap by an estimated 10 percent of the total wage gap. This overwork effect was sufficiently large to offset the wage equalizing effects of the narrowing gender gap in educational attainment and other forms of human capital. The overwork effect on trends in the gender gap in wages was most pronounced in professional and managerial occupations, where long work hours are especially common and the norm of overwork is deeply embedded in organizational practices and occupational cultures. These results illustrate how new ways of organizing work can perpetuate old forms of gender inequality.	gender wage gap, long work hours, overwork, gender inequality, stalled revolution
Choi, Sungjoo	Pay equity in government: Analyzing determinants of gender pay disparity in the US federal government	2015	Gender remains a critical factor explaining ongoing pay disparities, even after controlling for human-capital variables (e.g. tenure, work experience, education), job fields, and agency effects. It is notable that this pattern is also true among even federal agencies that are expected to adhere more strictly to federal law requiring equal treatment and due process.....education and organizational tenure (seniority) are the two most important factors explaining current salary disparities...	gender, pay equity, federal government

California Research Bureau
October 30, 2015

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Dowell, Michele Lee and Karen Larwin	Gender equity in educational administration: Investigating compensation and promotion	2013	This current study found significant differences in the salaries of female and male superintendents. The female respondents were at least one salary range below their male counterparts, while those female superintendents in urban areas were three salary ranges below the male superintendents.... To further examine possible contributors to the salary discrepancies of this study's respondents, years as a superintendent and educational degrees were taken into account..... For the purposes of this study, length of time in the position did not have an impact on explaining the salary differences. The same was true for educational degrees.... The career path to the superintendency has not changed much in the past years. The high school principal position still appears to be the most direct route. While more women are obtaining this position, they are still underrepresented as compared to the number of female teachers at the secondary level.	compensation, promotion, gender equity, career path
Faulk, Lewis, Lauren Hamilton Edwards, Gregory B. Lewis, and Jasmine McGinnis	An analysis of gender pay disparity in the nonprofit sector: An outcome of labor motivation or gendered jobs	2012	Although pay differences between men and women with comparable characteristics are generally smaller in the nonprofit than in the for-profit sector, gender pay gaps in the nonprofit sector vary widely across industries. In some industries, gender pay gaps are as large as in the for-profit sector, but in others, women make more than comparably qualified men.... We find that gender pay gaps in the nonprofit sector are smaller in industries where nonprofits outnumber for-profits and where higher proportions of female- dominated occupations exist.	wage equity, gender, nonprofit sector, worker motivation, hierarchical linear modeling
Gauchat, Gordon, Maura Kelly, and Michael Wallace	Occupational gender segregation, globalization, and gender earnings inequality in U.S. metropolitan areas	2012	We study factors contributing to the gender earnings ratio as well as the median earnings of men and women for 271 U.S. metropolitan areas. The results indicate that occupational segregation is still the leading determinant of gender earnings inequality, that its effects are only slightly diminished by the presence of globalization, and that various aspects of the global economy independently influence the gender earnings gap.	class/ stratification, comparative/ historical, sexuality
Gayle, George-Levi and Limor Golan	Estimating a dynamic adverse-selection model: Labour-force experience and the changing gender earnings gap 1968–1997	2012	It finds that labour-market experience is the most important factor explaining the gender earnings gap. In addition, statistical discrimination accounts for a large fraction of the observed gender earnings gap and its decline. It also finds that a large increase in aggregate productivity in professional occupations plays a major role in the increase in female labour force participation, number of hours worked, and the proportion of [women] working in professional occupations. Although of less importance, demographic changes account for a substantial part of the increase in female labour-force participation and hours worked, whereas home production technology shocks do not.	gender earnings gap, statistical discrimination, occupational sorting, human capital, structural estimation of

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Goldin, Claudia	A grand gender convergence: Its last chapter	2014	The solution does not (necessarily) have to involve government intervention and it need not make men more responsible in the home (although that wouldn't hurt). But it must involve changes in the labor market, especially how jobs are structured and remunerated to enhance temporal flexibility. The gender gap in pay would be considerably reduced and might vanish altogether if firms did not have an incentive to disproportionately reward individuals who labored long hours and worked particular hours. Such change has taken off in various sectors, such as technology, science, and health, but is less apparent in the corporate, financial, and legal worlds.	gender, pay gap, labor markets
Guy, Mary E. and Vanessa M. Fenley	Inch by inch: Gender equity since the Civil Rights Act of 1964	2014	The Civil Rights Act of 1964 was influential in leveling the playing field for women. More than the actual protections afforded by the act itself, it triggered subsequent laws that collectively have lessened the pay gap, provided protections from harassment, and increased opportunities for women to participate in education, sports, and workplace opportunities that were previously reserved for men. However, the pace at which these changes have occurred has extended over generations, and the goal of parity has yet to be reached. This article traces legislation that has helped women advance in the workplace and concludes by arguing for the expansion of how gender is conceptualized. Rather than the dichotomous male/female view, gender equity should embrace fairness for all, wherever they fall on the continuum from masculine to feminine.	gender equity, civil rights, sexual harassment, pay gap, employment
Harris, G.L.A.	The quest for gender equity	2011	These results are all interdependent in that the economic paths pursued by women affect their lifetime earnings, regardless of whether they marry and have children. Fundamentally, the choices that women make determine their lives, as each choice perpetuates the others to produce a life cycle of lower overall earning power.... Earnings inequities determine lifestyle choices.... women's choices are dependent on their division of labor at home, the probability of job segregation given the pool of candidates from which employers can select, and the fact that women make certain job choice selections based on anticipated discrimination (i.e., remaining in or leaving the labor force altogether).	inequality, women, choice
Hoffman, Saul	Geography and gender variation in the gender earnings ratio across US states	2015	This article documents the existence of nonneutral state effects on earnings by gender for YRFT workers that influence the gender earnings ratio even after controlling for the skill and demographic composition of male and female workers in that state.	gender, pay equity, states
Huffman, Matt L., Philip Cohen, and Jessica Pearlman	change: Organizational dynamics and workplace gender desegregation, 1975–2005	2010	We find that women's presence in managerial positions is positively related to gender integration, as is both establishment size and growth. Additionally, the results show that trends toward gender integration are due to change within workplaces rather than new, relatively integrated workplaces entering the population overtime. Our results also provide compelling evidence that the effect of female managers varies dramatically across organizational contexts, with the strongest desegregating effects in larger and growing establishments. Finally, the effect of women's access to organizational power structures has sharply diminished over time.	women, managers, gender integration

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Kronberg, Anne-Kathrin	Stay or leave? Externalization of job mobility and the effect on the U.S. gender earnings gap, 1979-2009	2013	The evidence reveals that the externalization is associated with a narrowing gender gap among some employees and a widening gap among others,...depending on whether employees work in good or bad jobs and whether changes were voluntary or involuntary.[G]ender disparities were initially particularly wide among leavers in good jobs, they continuously narrowed among voluntary leavers over time. This allowed both men and women to benefit from the increasing returns to leaving in good jobs....Although changing voluntarily in good jobs contributed to a narrowing of the gender gap, changing voluntarily in bad jobs did not have the same effect. Instead, gender differences have stayed the same among voluntary changers in bad jobs. I consider this to be a negative consequence, because the gender gap did close among stayers in bad jobs.... The externalization of job mobility had the most adverse effect on gender disparities among involuntary changers in good jobs.	gender, wage gap, external job mobility
Kulow, Marianne Delpo	Beyond the paycheck fairness act: Mandatory wage disclosure laws—a necessary tool for closing the residual gender wage gap	2013	Mandatory wage disclosure laws are a logical next step in the long effort to close the gender wage gap in the United States. The stalled progress on the gap illustrates that the "merit gap" is mostly closed. Multiple reliable studies indicate that even after correcting for the remaining impact of differential education among older workers, experience differences due to motherhood, self-imposed occupational segregation, and the glass ceiling, a wage gap remains that can most likely be explained by wage discrimination.... Wage disclosure laws are already in place for public sector workers and selected private sector employees. The existing wage disclosure laws have been unduly burdensome on the workplace and have yielded some promising results in narrowing the gender wage gap in the federal government workplace. Widespread private sector disclosure laws could be easily modeled on the existing mandatory wage disclosure laws.	gender, wage gap, wage disclosure, law
Lee, Young Joo and Doyeon Won	Trailblazing women in academia: Representation of women in senior faculty and the gender gap in junior faculty's salaries in higher educational institutions	2014	This study examines how women's representation at different levels of an organizational hierarchy predicts gender equity in assistant professors' salaries at four-year universities. This study suggests that women's proportion at the full professor rank is positively associated with improved gender equity in assistant professors' salaries, while women's proportion at the associate and assistant ranks is not significantly associated with improved gender equity. Institutions with a female president, however, have a greater wage gap. Overall, the results imply that the presence of women who blazed the trail of tenure and promotion contributes to the improved gender equity for their junior colleagues.... Overall, findings imply that disadvantages for women in tenure and promotion decisions not only affect gender equity for the current members of an institution but also shape gender-equity issues for future members.	representative bureaucracy, wage differentials, women in academia, tenure system

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Lips, Hilary	The gender pay gap: Challenging the rationalizations. Perceived equity, discrimination, and the limits of human capital models	2013	The data show that even when women and men appear to have equal investments in their work (equal levels of Education, similar occupations, etc.) they do not necessarily reap the equal outcomes in terms of pay that the human capital model would suggest.... Furthermore, the demonstration of an association, even a strong association, between a predictor and criterion variable, is vulnerable to multiple interpretations, including the possibility that both variables are being affected by an unmeasured third variable, that the criterion variable is actually causing changes in the predictor variable, or that there is a reciprocal causal relationship between predictor and criterion.... It may be time to move beyond regression equations that encompass more and more supposedly neutral predictor variables to “explain” an incrementally greater proportion of the pay gap. As we have seen, each predictor variable is embedded in several layers of context that shapes its meaning and its impact on the pay received by women and men. What we need to understand is not what predicts pay inequities, but why and how the processes operate—and how those processes could be subverted. (added: Field and case studies are needed).	gender, employment, discrimination, gender pay gap
Lips, Hilary	Acknowledging discrimination as a key to the gender pay gap	2013	U.S. Supreme Court Justice Ruth Bader Ginsberg...argued that institutionalized discrimination often happens in small increments over long periods and its impact should be treated as a whole rather than as a series of discrete discriminatory acts (Ledbetter v. Goodyear Tire & Rubber Co., 2007).... Some economists and statisticians...note that cumulative discrimination is likely “more than an additive process in which the effects of discriminatory incidents sum over time to form larger and larger outcome disparities. The probability of future discriminatory events may be causally related to past discriminatory events, so that current events may increase the probability of future discrimination” (Blank 2005, p. 225).... One way to resist acknowledging that the pay gap is a problem that requires serious attention is to keep searching for explanations for it other than pervasive, often implicit, unacknowledged and unintentional, discrimination against women. Thinking of the gender pay gap in terms of traditional human capital models seems to help to perpetuate this resistance and postpones attempts to intervene.	review, institutional discrimination, gender, pay gap
Macpherson Parrott, Heather	Housework, children, and women's wages across racial-ethnic groups	2014	Ultimately, this work contributes to a greater understanding of inequality among women, the connection between household labor and women’s wages, and how the motherhood penalty differs by racial–ethnic group.... I find that household labor explains a portion of the motherhood penalty for White women, who experience the most dramatic increases in household labor with additional children. Black and Hispanic women experience slight increases in housework with additional children, but neither children nor housework affects their already low wages.	motherhood penalty, household labor, wages, gender, race/ethnicity, work effort

California Research Bureau
October 30, 2015

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Madden, Janice Fanning	Performance-support bias and the gender pay gap among stockbrokers	2012	Women stockbrokers earned between 18 and 20 percent less than men at two of the nation's largest commercial brokerage houses in 1995. Gender differences in overall experience as a stockbroker or in tenure at the firm accounted for about a third of this gender pay gap. As both brokerage houses compensated brokers entirely by commissions using an algorithm that was the same for men and women, the gender pay gap was the result of gender differences in sales.... The "natural experiment" of observing sales by gender when stockbrokers were assigned accounts with equivalent prior sales histories yields evidence consistent with the hypothesis that there are no gender differences in sales capacities or productivity at these large retail brokerage houses. There is some evidence of stronger sales achievement for women in the organization (Melburn) at which women were less likely than men to receive transferred accounts, that is, when women were less likely to be selected into the experiment. When men and women were equally likely to be included in the experiment, at Jones where equivalent proportions of men and women stockbrokers received transferred accounts, there were no gender differentials in sales performance on accounts of equivalent prior sales histories.... The results of the "natural experiment" provide strong evidence that gender differences in neither selection into the stockbroker job nor work intensity have led to the observed gender differences in sales achievement or productivity. As discussed above, that leaves two other mechanisms that could have generated the gender pay and sales gap: (1) achievement or productivity differences arising from discrimination by customers and (2) performance-support bias such that an organization provides different sales opportunities, in terms of inputs and accounts, to women brokers.	demography/ population, organizations, work/ occupations, gender, pay gap, stockbrokers
Mandel, Hadas and Moshe Semyonov	Gender pay gap and employment sector: Sources of earnings disparities in the United States, 1970-2010	2014	[F]indings reveal a substantial reduction in the gross gender earnings gap in both sectors of the economy. Most of the decline is attributed to the reduction in the unexplained portion of the gap, implying a significant decline in economic discrimination against women. In contrast to discrimination, the role played by human capital and personal attributes in explaining the gender pay gap is relatively small in both sectors. Differences between the two sectors are not only in the size and pace of the reduction but also in the significance of the two major sources of the gap. Working hours have become the most important factor with respect to gender pay inequality in both sectors, although much more dominantly in the private sector. The declining gender segregation may explain the decreased impact of occupations on the gender pay gap in the private sector. In the public sector, by contrast, gender segregation still accounts for a substantial portion of the gap.	gender pay gaps, public sector, private sector, gender discrimination

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Masclet, David, Emmanuel Peterle, and Sophie Larribeau	Gender differences in tournament and flat-wage schemes: An experimental study	2015	Four key findings have emerged from our work. First, women exert significantly more effort than men under a flat wage despite the absence of any penalty for shirking.... Second, we identified no gender difference in performance under the tournament scheme, due to a combination of two effects. Consistent with previous findings, we observed that men more significantly increased their effort when switching from a flat wage to a tournament setting. On the other hand, women had less margin to increase their performance when switching from flat wage to tournament since their effort had already been relatively high under the flat-wage scheme. Third, we found that women were less likely to enter into competition than men.... This finding seems to be partly explained by men being more overconfident than women in their abilities. Fourth and last, experience tends to narrow the gender gap with respect to tournament entry; this is mainly due to initially overconfident, lower-performing males revising their beliefs in their own ability.	experiment, gender differences, tournament scheme, flat-wage scheme
Maume, David and Leah Ruppanner	State liberalism, female supervisors and the gender wage gap	2015	[W]e found that women who reported to a female supervisor earned higher pay, and that this effect was amplified when women lived in liberal states. We argued that in more liberal states with larger public sectors, government oversight to ensure equality empowered more women who then reduced the gender gap in pay.... [W]omen earned less than men, everyone earned less when they reported to a female supervisor, and these inequality-generating effects dwarfed the slight ameliorative effect on the gender pay gap when women worked for a female boss and lived in a liberal state. Furthermore, the size of the gender pay gap was invariant across political contexts, suggesting its stubbornness and persistence as a barrier to achieving gender parity in the labor market.... Our results suggest that it is not necessarily whether women in power reduce gender inequality, but how and in what contexts do female leaders ameliorate gender inequality among subordinates. Top female managers may indeed have the power to hire, fire, reward and promote subordinates in ways that reduce inequality, whereas female supervisors may only be able to set work schedules, count absences, conduct performance reviews, etc., and otherwise lack the power to alter the pay of their subordinates.	sex gap in pay, gender inequality, female supervisors
McGee, Andrew, Peter McGee, and Jessica Pan	Performance pay, competitiveness, and the gender wage gap: Evidence from the United States	2015	In the laboratory, Niederle and Vesterlund (2007) and Dagnies (2012) find that women are 38 and 33 percentage points, respectively, less likely to opt into competitive tournaments than their male peers. In the NLSY cohorts, we observe significantly less gender segregation in the receipt of competitive performance pay in the labor market than in the laboratory, and this gender difference accounts for a small portion of the gender wage gap.	gender wage gap, competitive, performance pay

California Research Bureau
October 30, 2015

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Merluzzi, Jennifer and Stansilav Dobrev	Unequal on top: Gender profiling and the income gap among high earner male and female professionals	2015	[W]e uncovered two pathways to the growing income gap between men and women — disproportionate rewards to tenure with the firm and to job changes with different employers. Either career strategy—internal progression within the firm or external mobility—clearly disadvantages women relative to men.....we convincingly demonstrated that [external mobility] clearly disadvantages women compared with men—income disparity results from unequal rewards to both organizational tenure and inter-firm mobility. Women do worse than their male counterparts whether they stay and commit or move across firms.... While women are disadvantaged by the disproportionate rewards they receive from internal and external mobility, the gender gap grows larger with external mobility than with increasing job tenure..... It is not surprising that recent years have seen a withdrawal of female employees from professional occupations (Hom et al., 2008; Forbes, 2012).	career studies, gender earnings gap, income inequality, higher earners
Mouw, Ted and Arne L. Kalleberg	Occupations and the structure of wage inequality in the United States, 1980s to 2000s	2010	We model the mean and variance of wages for each occupation...to test three competing explanations of the increase in wage inequality: between-occupation polarization, changes in education and demographic composition, and within-occupation residual inequality (net of human capital variables).... [W]e find that between occupation changes explain 66 percent of the increase in wage inequality from 1992 to 2008, although 23 percent of this is due to the switch to the 2000 occupation codes in 2003.... Sensitivity analysis reveals that 18 percent of the overall increase in inequality from 1983 to 2002 results from changes in just three occupations: managers NEC, secretaries, and computer systems analysts.... The effects of the polarization of occupations may be focused on a relatively small number of occupations, rather than being a general feature of the occupational structure. This result underscores the utility of studying specific occupational labor markets that may be key to understanding the sources of the recent increase in wage inequality, rather than examining patterns of inequality for the entire labor force.	labor markets, trends in inequality, occupational polarization, human capital models, wage gap, controlling for gender
Oh, Seong Soo and Gregory Lewis	Stemming inequality? Employment and pay of female and minority scientists and engineers	2011	Although the gender and racial pay gap still persists, female and minority college graduates earn more relative to comparable white men in STEM than other fields. For white men, a career in engineering or computer science pays only marginally better than one in business and finance and markedly less than being a manager, lawyer, or health care practitioner. Female and minority engineers and computer scientists, however, generally earn substantially more than comparable women and minorities in business and finance and as much as or more than lawyers and health care practitioners; STEM women even earn more than comparable female managers.... Federal efforts to increase the representativeness of the STEM workforce should increase pay equality in the economy by moving women and minorities into traditionally high-paying fields. Indeed, their rewards to STEM occupations appear even higher than white men's.	discrimination, earnings of scientists and engineers, women and minorities in science

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Olson, Josephine	Human capital models and the gender pay gap	2013	Human capital theory has its place in helping to understand gender wage gaps, but measures of human capital are not totally a matter of free choice unaffected by social norms. Researchers would do well to remind readers that variables such as work experience, education and occupation may still be subject to gender discrimination. What is also interesting and disappointing is that despite the increased value of U.S. women's human capital variables (especially full-time work experience) and women's movement into previously male dominated occupations, the gender wage gap has been fairly constant in recent years (Blau and Kahn 2006).	review, human capital theory, gender discrimination, gender, wage gap
Olson, Kristi	Our choices, our wage gap?	2012	According to recent empirical studies, much, if not all, of the gender wage gap is attributable to individual choice. Women tend to choose lower-paying jobs and to prioritize family over career while men tend to do the opposite. This has led some policymakers to conclude that the gender wage gap does not require rectification. Although feminists have typically responded by refuting the empirical claim, I argue in this essay that they should also refute the normative claim. In particular, individual choice does not exonerate the gender wage gap if the options from which women and men choose are biased in favor of men. Yet, despite extensive research on individual choice, virtually no attention has been paid to the effect of the state's choice of regulatory regime on the gender wage gap. In this essay, I suggest some of the mechanisms—e.g., licensing laws and scope of practice restrictions—that could potentially bias wages in favor of men.	gender; pay gap, choice, regulating choice
Reese, Catherine and Barbara Warner	Pay equity in the states: An analysis of the gender-pay gap in the public sector	2012	[W]omen employed by states that have enacted a major pay equity adjustment for female-dominated job classes at some time in the past 25 years or so should enjoy an approximately US\$5.26 better aggregate wage than women employed by states that have not enacted such a law and/or adjustment.....women living in wealthier states also should see a similar US\$5.41 better relative wage than women employed by poorer states. Also, women living in states where there are relatively more women in the population will fare better than those in states with relatively fewer women. It does not seem to matter much, per this model, whether one lives in a state with a higher percentage of women legislators or a state that has elected a woman governor or whether a state has passed the federal ERA or not. Most unexpectedly, states with a higher percentage of self-identified liberals actually see a decrease in women's relative wages, and by a hefty amount.....Surprisingly, women employed by states in the traditionalistic group, long associated with less progressive public policies, have a better wage relative to men than women employed by states in either the moralistic or individualistic group....women who are employed by the states have a better wage relative to men than women employed by the private sector.	equal pay, gender and public personnel administration, state government HRM, compensation and classification, discrimination

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Renzulli, Linda, Jeremy Reynolds, Kimberly Kelly, and Linda Grant	Pathways to gender inequality in faculty pay: The impact of institution academic division and rank	2013	For the most part, we found that men and women in particular niches have similar pay and that gender pay differences depend on another process. Specifically, women earn less than men in the academy because they are located in different niches defined by combinations of institution type, division, and rank. Women are more likely than men to be located in niches that pay less well.... We find that the combinations of institution, division, and rank have implications for pay above and beyond the effects of any one.... We thus find evidence that allocative processes into niches play an important role in generating gender inequality in the academy.	gender pay inequality, higher education, work, gender
Reynolds, Jeremy and Jeffrey Wenger	He said, she said: The gender wage gap according to self and proxy reports in the current population survey	2012	[W]e find that self-reported wages are higher than proxy-reported wages even after controlling for all time invariant characteristics. Furthermore, we find that changes in the use of proxy respondents by men and women since 1979 have made current estimates of the gender wage gap larger than they would have been without changes in reporting status. This suggests that the gender wage gap has closed more than previously estimated. We recommend that researchers combine self and proxy responses with great care, especially when analyzing time trends or making gender comparisons.	proxy response, response bias, gender wage decompositions
Roche, Kristen	An active-learning exercise on learning negotiation as a way to mitigate the gender wage gap for introductory microeconomics	2014	A relevant and important topic for students, especially [women] is the persistence of the gender wage gap. Of the many external and internal barriers that impede equal wages, one obstacle that students can learn and practice is their ability to negotiate effectively. Evidence that a negotiation gap between men and women presents an opportunity to engage and empower students, particularly females, in the real-world application of negotiation.	Negotiation distributive bargaining, active-learning, gender, wage gap
Roche, Kristen	Gender differences in the returns to education in self employment: Does occupation matter?	2013	On average, self-employed women invest in more education than self-employed men, but their hourly earnings differ greatly, amounting to a 70% median wage gap.... Compared to self-employed men, self-employed women have more education but considerably lower earnings, generating differences in the returns to education by gender. This paper finds evidence that men typically benefit from a complementary relationship between education and earnings. However, women are heterogeneous in their returns to education. Women who self-employ in traditionally female occupations do not benefit from this complementary relationship, and women who self-employ in traditionally male occupations earn returns that are more similar to the male experience.	self-employment, women, gender, education, occupation

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Ruel, Erin and Robert M. Hauser	Explaining the gender wealth gap	2015	We find large gender wealth gaps between currently married men and women, and between never-married men and women. The never-married accumulate less wealth than the currently married, and there is a marital disruption cost to wealth accumulation. The status-attainment model shows the most power in explaining gender wealth gaps between these groups explaining about one-third to one-half of the gap, followed by the human-capital explanation. In other words, a lifetime of lower earnings for women translates into greatly reduced wealth accumulation. After controlling for the full model, we find that a gender wealth gap remains between married men and women that we speculate may be related to gender differences in investment strategies and selection effects.	gender, net worth, wealth gap, Wisconsin Longitudinal Study
Ryu, Kirak	State policies and gender earnings inequality: A multilevel analysis of 50 U.S. states based on U.S. Census 2000 data	2010	In the U.S. labor market, state governments have narrowed the gender gap in earnings by legislation that promotes federal equal employment opportunity initiatives. Female employees are better off in terms of gender equity claims when they work in states with progressive institutional environments.... However, states as welfare provider and employers have the opposite effect on the gender gap in earnings. The negative effect of the size of public social service employment on the gender gap in earnings indicates that state governments enhance opportunities for employment in general for female employees in social service sectors such as health, education, and welfare where the demands for female employees are usually higher. Therefore, more jobs are available for female employees in occupational positions when the size of the public social service sector is large. However, those jobs do not guarantee higher levels of rewards for female employees compared to other positions, which unexpectedly leads to an increase in the gender gap in earnings. Consequently, the overall effects of these two dimensions of state government intervention are not predetermined, but depend on other aspects of earnings determinations.	state policies, gender, wage gap
Santos-Pinto, Luís	Labor market signaling and self-confidence: Wage compression and the gender pay gap	2012	I extend Spence's signaling model by assuming that some workers are overconfident—they underestimate their marginal cost of acquiring education—and some are under confident. Firms cannot observe workers' productive abilities and beliefs but know the fractions of high-ability, overconfident, and under confident workers. I find that biased beliefs lower the wage spread and compress the wages of unbiased workers. I show that gender differences in self-confidence can contribute to the gender pay gap. If education raises productivity, men are overconfident, and women underconfident, then women will, on average, earn less than men. Finally, I show that biased beliefs can improve welfare.	wage compression, gender, wage gap

California Research Bureau
October 30, 2015

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Sauré, Pierre and Hosny Zoabi	International trade, the gender wage gap and female labor force participation	2014	The current paper... [argues] that as trade expands female intensive sectors, the gender wage gap may actually widen, inducing female labor force participation to fall.... [T]rade integration of a capital-abundant economy brings about an expansion in the female intensive sector and a contraction in the male intensive sector. As a result, male labor reallocates from the contracting sector to the expanding one. This migration dilutes the capital-labor ratio in the female intensive sector. The relatively strong complementarity between capital and female labor causes the marginal productivity of women to drop more than that of men. Thus, the gender wage gap widens and female labor force participation falls.... Our cross-state regressions suggest that, in rich economies, international trade with poor countries tends to increase the gender wage gap and reduce female labor force participation.	female labor force participation, gender wage gap, home production, NAFTA
Sayers, Rachel C.	The cost of being female: Critical comment on Block	2012	Women currently earn 77 cents for every dollar earned by men. Explanations abound for why, exactly, this wage gap exists. One of the more potent justifications attributes this pay differential to the unequal effects of marriage on the sexes: the marital asymmetry hypothesis. However, even when marital status is accounted for, a small but significant residual gap remains. This article argues that this is the result of social factors. Entrenched societal sexism causes all of us to harbor unconscious bias about the capabilities and proper gender roles of women. This bias, in turn, leads us to discount work completed by [women], especially in professional environments. Employers are not immune from this effect, and the undervaluation of female ability affects hiring practices, leading to the residual wage gap.	feminism, discrimination, pay gap, wage differentials, sexism, marital asymmetry
Shatnawi, Dina, Ronald Oaxaca, and Michael Ransom	Applying fixed effects to hierarchical segregation models	2011	This study provides a framework for evaluating decompositions in a panel setting using the hierarchical segregation methodology originally developed by Baldwin, Butler, and Johnson (2001). We believe that our contribution of including the cross-sectional heterogeneous effects and accounting for the unbalanced nature of the data can easily be extended in the most simple decomposition. It is difficult to imagine a case where labor market data from a single firm will be balanced. While estimation of the fixed-effects coefficients are not affected by the unbalanced nature of the data, the derivation and results of the decomposition will be altered. Further investigation is required to better specify the wage models when the institutional details of the firm are unknown.	
Siniscalco, Gary, Lauri Damrell, and Clara Morain Nabity	The pay gap, the glass ceiling, and pay bias: Moving forwards fifty years after the equal pay act	2014	Ultimately, instead of focusing so much on “cracking down” on employers, men and women would be better served if the Administration encouraged social, political, and economic dialogue to understand better the reasons behind the pay gap and develop programs to address its more complex causes. It is possible that progress has stalled not because discrimination laws are ineffective (indeed, most would agree that we have come quite far), but because they address a small part of the issue. Only with a more well-rounded and open-minded perspective can we begin to discuss practical and innovative solutions to take us into the next fifty years and beyond.	gender, pay gap, glass ceiling, culture

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Smith, Kristen and Rebecca Glauber	Exploring the spatial wage penalty for women: Does it matter where you live?	2013	We explore differences in the spatial wage gap by education, occupation, and industry. Regression models that control for marriage, motherhood, race, education, region, age, and work hours indicate that metropolitan women earn 17% more per hour than nonmetropolitan women. Nonmetropolitan women earn less than metropolitan women who live in central cities and outside central cities. The gap in metropolitan-nonmetropolitan wages is higher for more educated women than for less educated women. The wage gap is only 5% for women without a high school degree, but it is 15% for women with a college degree and 26% for women with an advanced degree. Nonmetropolitan college graduates are overrepresented in lower-paying occupations and industries. Metropolitan college graduates, however, are overrepresented in higher-paying occupations and industries, such as professional services and finance.	inequality, earnings, gender, rural, work, women
Srivastava, Sameer B. and Eliot L. Sherman	Agents of change or cogs in the machine? Reexamining the influence of female managers on the gender wage gap	2015	Building on the groundwork laid by Penner et al. (2012), the present study sought to examine the direct effects that female supervisors can have on the gender wage gap among the employees whom they supervise by estimating within-individual models.... These models... accounted for unobserved individual differences that could influence what kinds of subordinates were matched to male or female supervisors or that could be associated with a person's likelihood of obtaining differential rewards from same-gender supervisors.... Results of both between- and within-individual models indicated no support for the agents-of-change expectation; rather, across a variety of specifications, we found that the gender of managers had no discernible effect on the gender wage gap among their subordinates. Supplemental analyses indicated that, insofar as managerial gender mattered, it was in the subsample of high-performing managers who supervised low-performing employees. In this group, female managers, perhaps responding to collective threat, appeared to act in ways that amplified, rather than diminished, the gender wage gap.... Surprisingly, our results indicate that—at least in contexts where they might perceive collective threat from less qualified female aspirants—female managers may instead act in ways that amplify the gender wage gap.	managers; gender; wage gap
Taekjin Shin	The gender gap in executive compensation: The role of female directors and chief executive officers	2012	While many studies have explored the issue of women's representation among top management, little is known about the gender gap in compensation among those who reached the top. Consistent with theories on social identity and demographic similarity effects, the gender gap in executive pay is smaller when a greater number of women sit on the compensation committee of the board, which is the group responsible for setting executive compensation. However, the presence of a female chief executive officer (CEO) is not associated with the compensation of female non-CEO executives working under the female boss.	gender, executive compensation, board of directors, compensation committee, chief executive officer, CEO

California Research Bureau
October 30, 2015

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Tick, Simona Lup and Ronald Oaxaca	Technological change and gender wage gaps in the US service industry	2010	Results reveal a narrowing effect of technological change on the female-male wages for the highest skill level occupation (managerial, professional occupations). This effect is robust to controlling for the unexplained gender wage gap and to using direct measures of technological change. The effect of technological change on the gender wage gaps for the other skill levels tends to diminish or disappear altogether once changes in unexplained gender wage gaps are adjusted for. The results highlight the importance of considering the unexplained gender wage gaps in examining the effect of technological change on the gender wage gaps.	technological change, gender, wage gap
Tinsley, Catherine, Taeya Howell, and Emily Amanatullah	Who should bring home the bacon? How deterministic views of gender constrain spousal wage preferences	2015	We find that strong beliefs in the determinism gender, in other words, that gender is immutable, have important implications for individual wage preferences and in women's work choices. The higher a person's gender determinism (GD), the more he or she adheres to, and acts in ways to promote, traditional social roles. We also found that, on average, people (regardless of gender, age, and race), preferred the traditional model of the male breadwinner. The continuing gender wage gap at the societal level may both reflect and re-enforce an individual's deterministic views of gender and intra-marital wage preferences.	gender and wage inequity, determinism, social role theory, implicit person theory
Travis, Michelle A.	Disabling the gender pay gap: Lessons from the social model of disability	2015	Causal narratives are enormously influential in directing not only our social assessments of responsibility but also our legal assessments of discrimination liability. The women don't ask narrative has been particularly powerful. This narrative holds women themselves responsible for the gender wage gap, and it buttresses a legal regime that allows employers to avoid liability for pay-setting practices that are built upon gender stereotypes and that entrench gender pay inequality. Although the social science research itself reveals this reality by demonstrating the role that gender stereotypes play in creating and sustaining women's differential negotiation approaches and results, the women don't ask causal narrative is so pervasive that it needs a theoretical framework to help shift the internal causal attribution upon which the narrative rests. The social model is a causal attribution theory that achieved a similar objective for disability rights, by replacing the internal causal attribution of the medical model of disability with an external causal attribution that focused instead on the employment practices that render various characteristics disabling. As a causal attribution theory, the social model provides a useful tool for the women's rights movement, which needs a way to make salient the role that employers' wage-setting practices play in sustaining the gender pay gap.	gender, law, wage gap, causal narrative

California Research Bureau
October 30, 2015

Author(s)	Title	Year	Findings	Keywords
Weinberger, Catherine and Peter J. Kuhn	Changing levels or changing slopes? The narrowing of the gender earnings gap 1959–1999	2010	Once educational attainment and other observable characteristics have been controlled for, studies show that the gender wage gap among adult full-time workers is about half the size it was in 1980.... [T]he authors investigate the extent to which the decline in this gap was associated with changes across cohorts in the relative rate of wage growth after labor market entry (slopes), versus changes in relative earnings levels at labor market entry (levels). They find that slope changes associated with post-schooling investments, including work experience, account for no more than one-third of the narrowing of the gender wage gap over the past 40 years. The majority of the narrowing can be attributed to factors present at the time that successive cohorts entered the labor market, such as a growing demand for women's unobserved skills or declining discrimination.	gender, wage gap, post-schooling investment
Weinberger, Catherine J.	In search of the glass ceiling: Gender and earnings growth among U.S. college graduates in the 1990s	2011	[The author] finds similar average rates of earnings growth for women and men across numerous specifications, which suggests that the gender gap in earnings is determined by factors already present early in the career. Her findings reveal slower earnings growth in only two subsets of women: young mothers, who experience slower earnings growth during the early career relative to men the same age, but then compensate with faster growth later in their careers; and women with exceptionally high earnings levels. The latter are underrepresented among workers winning the largest promotions, when compared to similarly successful men the same age, and face a glass ceiling at the very top of the career ladder.	gender, wage gap, law
Zackin, Martha	Scrutiny of gender disparities in pay: At the executive level and below	2012	Not an article quote: This article chronicles federal-level political activity regarding the wage gap. This includes analyses of the Equal Pay Act, Paycheck Fairness Act, and the Obama Administrations' activities among others.	Women, law, wage gap

Methodology

Academic Literature Review

First we searched the UC database “Melvyl” for full text articles about the United States gender wage gap published from 2010 to July 2015, when the literature review was performed. Search terms included earnings gap, gender and wage inequity, gender earnings gap, gender earnings inequality, gender earnings ratio, gender inequality, gender pay disparity, gender wage decompositions, gender wage gap, occupational segregation, sex gap in pay, wage differentials and other similar keywords. We then went through each of the search results, read the abstract and determined if the article was specifically about the gender wage gap in the United States. If it was, we included it in our spreadsheet presented here. We repeated this search using EBSCO (Academic Source Complete), Elsevier Science Direct, Social Science Quarterly and JSTOR.

We next searched Web of Science’s cited author search using each of the articles we located to find other relevant academic articles that cite those articles. We then went through each of the search results, read the abstract and determined if the article was specifically about the gender wage gap in the United States. If it was we included it in our spreadsheet presented here.

These searches were performed Anoli Motawala. Literature compiled and reviewed for document by Tonya D. Lindsey.

Note: The article from 2016 was found using a brief search of Google Scholar. A full literature review of scholarly articles published since June 2015 is pending. Article added June 03, 2016.